

LETICIA C. PIMENTEL

One Financial Plaza, 14th Floor  
Providence, RI 02903-2485  
Main (401) 709-3300  
Fax (401) 709-3378  
lpimentel@rc.com  
Direct (401) 709-3337

Also admitted in Massachusetts

December 11, 2023

**VIA ELECTRONIC MAIL AND HAND DELIVERY**

Luly E. Massaro, Clerk  
Rhode Island Public Utilities Commission  
89 Jefferson Boulevard  
Warwick, RI 02888

**Re: Docket No. 23-35-EE – 2024-2026 Three Year Energy Efficiency Plan and  
2024 Annual Energy Efficiency Plan  
Responses to PUC Data Requests – Set 9**

Dear Ms. Massaro:

On behalf of The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy (“Rhode Island Energy” or the “Company”), I have enclosed the Company’s responses to the Ninth Set of Data Requests issued by the Public Utilities Commission in the above-referenced docket.

Please contact me if you have any questions. Thank you for your attention to this matter.

Very truly yours,



Leticia C. Pimentel

cc: Docket 23-35-EE Service List

Certificate of Service

I hereby certify that a copy of the cover letter and any materials accompanying this certificate were electronically transmitted to the individuals listed below.

The paper copies of this filing are being hand delivered to the Rhode Island Public Utilities Commission and to the Rhode Island Division of Public Utilities and Carriers.

Heidi J. Seddon

December 11, 2023

Date

**Docket No. 23-35-EE – Rhode Island Energy’s EE Plan 2024-2026 Three-Year Plan and 2024 Annual EEP  
Service list updated 10/4/2023**

Name /Address	E-mail Distribution List	Phone
<p><b>The Narragansett Electric Company d/b/a Rhode Island Energy</b> Andrew Marcaccio, Esq. 280 Melrose St. Providence, RI 02907</p> <p>Leticia C. Pimentel, Esq. Steve Boyajian, Esq. <b>Robinson &amp; Cole LLP</b> One Financial Plaza, 14th Floor Providence, RI 02903</p>	<p><a href="mailto:amarcaccio@pplweb.com">amarcaccio@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:cobrien@pplweb.com">cobrien@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:jhutchinson@pplweb.com">jhutchinson@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:jscanlon@pplweb.com">jscanlon@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:dmoreira@rienergy.com">dmoreira@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:MOcCrayne@rienergy.com">MOcCrayne@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:BSFeldman@rienergy.com">BSFeldman@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:ACL@rienergy.com">ACL@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:DJTukey@rienergy.com">DJTukey@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:SBriggs@pplweb.com">SBriggs@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:BJPelletier@rienergy.com">BJPelletier@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:JOliveira@pplweb.com">JOliveira@pplweb.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:Teast@rienergy.com">Teast@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:Masiegal@rienergy.com">Masiegal@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:Cagill@rienergy.com">Cagill@rienergy.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:sboyajian@rc.com">sboyajian@rc.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:LPimentel@rc.com">LPimentel@rc.com</a>;  <a href="mailto:HSeddon@rc.com">HSeddon@rc.com</a>;</p>	<p>401-784-4263</p>
<p><b>Division of Public Utilities &amp; Carriers</b> Margaret L. Hogan, Esq.</p>	<p><a href="mailto:Margaret.L.Hogan@dpuc.ri.gov">Margaret.L.Hogan@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:Christy.hetherington@dpuc.ri.gov">Christy.hetherington@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:john.bell@dpuc.ri.gov">john.bell@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:Joel.munoz@dpuc.ri.gov">Joel.munoz@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:Ellen.golde@dpuc.ri.gov">Ellen.golde@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:Machaela.Seaton@dpuc.ri.gov">Machaela.Seaton@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;  <a href="mailto:Paul.Roberti@dpuc.ri.gov">Paul.Roberti@dpuc.ri.gov</a>;</p>	<p>401-780-2120</p>

Tim Woolf Jennifer Kallay Synapse Energy Economics 22 Pearl Street Cambridge, MA 02139	<a href="mailto:twoolf@synapse-energy.com">twoolf@synapse-energy.com;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:jkallay@synapse-energy.com">jkallay@synapse-energy.com;</a>	
<b>RI EERMC</b> Marisa Desautel, Esq. Desautel Browning Law 38 Bellevue Ave., Unit H Newport, RI 02840	<a href="mailto:marisa@desautelbrowning.com">marisa@desautelbrowning.com;</a>	401-477-0023
	<a href="mailto:Adrian.Caesar@nv5.com">Adrian.Caesar@nv5.com;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Craig.Johnson@nv5.com">Craig.Johnson@nv5.com;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Samuel.Ross@nv5.com">Samuel.Ross@nv5.com;</a>	
<b>Office of Energy Resources (OER)</b> Albert Vitali, Esq. Dept. of Administration Division of Legal Services One Capitol Hill, 4 <sup>th</sup> Floor Providence, RI 02908	<a href="mailto:Albert.Vitali@doa.ri.gov">Albert.Vitali@doa.ri.gov;</a>	401-222-8880
	<a href="mailto:Nancy.Russolino@doa.ri.gov">Nancy.Russolino@doa.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Christopher.Kearns@energy.ri.gov">Christopher.Kearns@energy.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:William.Owen@energy.ri.gov">William.Owen@energy.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Steven.Chybowski@energy.ri.gov">Steven.Chybowski@energy.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Nathan.Cleveland@energy.ri.gov">Nathan.Cleveland@energy.ri.gov;</a>	
<b>Original &amp; 9 copies file w/:</b> Luly E. Massaro, Commission Clerk John Harrington, Commission Counsel Public Utilities Commission 89 Jefferson Blvd. Warwick, RI 02888	<a href="mailto:Luly.massaro@puc.ri.gov">Luly.massaro@puc.ri.gov;</a>	401-780-2107
	<a href="mailto:John.Harrington@puc.ri.gov">John.Harrington@puc.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Alan.nault@puc.ri.gov">Alan.nault@puc.ri.gov;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Todd.bianco@puc.ri.gov">Todd.bianco@puc.ri.gov ;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:Emma.Rodvien@puc.ri.gov">Emma.Rodvien@puc.ri.gov;</a>	
<b>Interested Party</b>		
<b>Dept. of Human Services</b> Frederick Sneesby	<a href="mailto:Frederick.sneesby@dhs.ri.gov">Frederick.sneesby@dhs.ri.gov;</a>	
<b>RI Infrastructure Bank</b> Chris Vitale, Esq.,	<a href="mailto:cvitale@hvlawltd.com">cvitale@hvlawltd.com;</a>	
	<a href="mailto:SUsatine@riib.org">SUsatine@riib.org;</a>	
<b>Green Energy Consumers Alliance</b> Larry Chretien, Executive Director	<a href="mailto:Larry@massenergy.org">Larry@massenergy.org;</a>	
Amanda Barker	<a href="mailto:amanda@greenenergyconsumers.org">amanda@greenenergyconsumers.org;</a>	
<b>Acadia Center</b> Emily Koo, Director	<a href="mailto:EKoo@acadiacenter.org">EKoo@acadiacenter.org;</a>	401-276-0600 x402

The Narragansett Electric Company  
d/b/a Rhode Island Energy  
RIPUC Docket No. 23-35-EE  
In Re: 2024-2026 Three-Year Energy Efficiency Plan and  
2024 Annual Energy Efficiency Plan  
Responses to the Commission’s Ninth Set of Data Requests  
Issued on December 8, 2023

---

PUC 9-1

Request:

Please provide a table showing the following information from the 2021, 2022, and 2023 Electric Efficiency Plans:

- a. Planned lifetime electric savings (MWh)
- b. Actual lifetime electric savings (MWh)
- c. Planned lifetime oil savings (MMBtu)
- d. Actual lifetime oil savings (MMBtu)
- e. Planned lifetime propane savings (MMBtu)
- f. Actual lifetime propane savings (MMBtu)

Response:

The table below illustrates planned and actual savings for electric, oil, and gas from 2021, 2022, and 2023. The planned values for 2021-2023 were pulled from the annual energy efficiency plans and the actuals for 2021-2022 were pulled from the year end reports. The 2023 actual lifetime electric savings is the year-end 2023 forecast. The 2023 actual lifetime oil and propane savings were estimated by taking the ratio of year-end forecasted electric savings over the planned amount of electric savings for 2023 and applying that ratio to the planned savings for oil and propane.

<b>Year</b>	<b>Planned Lifetime Electric Savings (MWh)</b>	<b>Actual Lifetime Electric Savings (MWh)</b>	<b>Planned Lifetime Oil Savings (MMBtu)</b>	<b>Annual Lifetime Oil Savings (MMBtu)</b>	<b>Planned Lifetime Propane Savings (MMBtu)</b>	<b>Actual Lifetime Propane Savings (MMBtu)</b>
2021	1,306,562	1,046,790	689,552	1,061,726	46,610	53,460
2022	1,145,371	712,989	712,329	548,313	37,735	14,572
2023	685,209	632,623 (forecasted)	878,685	574,407 (estimated)	80,276	40,274 (estimated)

The Narragansett Electric Company  
d/b/a Rhode Island Energy  
RIPUC Docket No. 23-35-EE  
In Re: 2024-2026 Three-Year Energy Efficiency Plan and  
2024 Annual Energy Efficiency Plan  
Responses to the Commission’s Ninth Set of Data Requests  
Issued on December 8, 2023

---

PUC 9-2

Request:

Referencing the proposed 2024 Electric and Gas performance incentive filed by the Company in the Corrected Responses to PUC and Division Data Requests on December 5, 2023, please express the proposed gas and electric PIM earnings in basis point equivalents.

Response:

Please see the tables below for the proposed electric and gas PIM earnings expressed in basis point equivalents.

<b>Electric</b>	<b>2024</b>
Energy Efficiency Budget (\$ Million)	\$96.8
Spending Budget (\$ Million)	\$87.1
Target Incentive	\$4,733,862
Energy Efficiency Program Charge (\$/kWh)	\$0.0110
Annual Cost to 500 kWh/Month Residential Customer w/o Tax	\$65.76
Annual Cost to 500 kWh/Month Residential Customer w/ Tax (1)	\$68.50

Notes:

(1) Assumes Tax Rate of 4%.

Gross Earnings Tax Assumption (%):

<u>Per annual Electric earnings reports for the 12 months ended:</u>	<u>Dec-2024</u>
Average rate base	\$1,131,846,844
Equity component percentage	50.95%
Equity rate base	\$76,675,967
Target Incentive as Basis Points of ROE	82.1

The Narragansett Electric Company  
d/b/a Rhode Island Energy  
RIPUC Docket No. 23-35-EE  
In Re: 2024-2026 Three-Year Energy Efficiency Plan and  
2024 Annual Energy Efficiency Plan  
Responses to the Commission’s Ninth Set of Data Requests  
Issued on December 8, 2023

---

PUC 9-2, Page 2

<b>Gas</b>	<b>2024</b>
Energy Efficiency Budget (\$ Million)	\$34.3
Spending Budget (\$ Million)	\$31.4
Target Incentive	\$899,054
Residential System Benefits Charge (\$/Therm)	\$0.1006
C&I System Benefits Charge (\$/Therm)	\$0.0749
Annual Cost to 846 Therm/Year Residential Customer w/o Tax	\$85.11
Annual Cost to 846 Therm/Year Residential Customer w/ Tax (1)	\$87.74

Notes:

(1) Assumes Tax Rate of 3%.

Gross Earnings Tax Assumption (%):

<u>Per annual Electric earnings reports for the 12 months ended:</u>	<u>Dec-2024</u>
Average rate base	\$1,371,238,519
Equity component percentage	50.95%
Equity rate base	\$698,646,025
Target Incentive as Basis Points of ROE	12.9

The Narragansett Electric Company  
d/b/a Rhode Island Energy  
RIPUC Docket No. 23-35-EE  
In Re: 2024-2026 Three-Year Energy Efficiency Plan and  
2024 Annual Energy Efficiency Plan  
Responses to the Commission's Ninth Set of Data Requests  
Issued on December 8, 2023

---

PUC 9-3

Request:

Please re-calculate the 2024 electric and gas Performance Incentive using only intrastate (RI only) benefits. Refile Tables E-8C and G-8C showing the results of the recalculations.

Response:

Please note that this response incorporates corrections from the *Corrected Responses to PUC and Division Data Requests* filed on December 5, 2023, and/or other corrections made in this docket.

Please see Attachment PUC 9-3-1 for a revised Table E-8C containing the recalculated 2024 electric performance incentive using only intrastate (RI only) benefits. Please see Attachment PUC 9-3-2 for a revised Table G-8C containing the recalculated 2024 gas performance incentive using only intrastate (RI only) benefits.

**Table E-8C**  
**Rhode Island Energy**  
**2024 PIM and SQA (\$000)**

	Performance Incentive								
	Eligible Benefits		Eligible Costs	Eligible Net Benefits	Design Performance Achievement	Design Payout Rate	Design Performance Payout	Payout Cap	Service Quality Adjustment Applied
	100% Utility System Benefits	50% Resource Benefits							
Residential	\$20,128	\$10,368	\$30,238	\$258	\$258	10.1%	\$26	\$33	FALSE
Income Eligible Residential	\$5,954	\$1,719	\$16,230	-\$8,558	\$2,000	25.0%	\$500	\$625	TRUE
Commercial & Industrial	\$52,969	-\$521	\$40,592	\$11,856	\$11,856	10.1%	\$1,198	\$1,498	FALSE

	Service Quality Adjustment (SQA)				
	Eligible Benefits		Eligible Costs	Design Service Achievement	Maximum SQA
	100% Utility System Benefits	50% Resource Benefits			
Residential	\$20,128	\$10,368	\$30,238	\$30,496	\$0
Income Eligible Residential	\$5,954	\$1,719	\$16,230	\$7,673	\$297
Commercial & Industrial	\$52,969	-\$521	\$40,592	\$52,448	\$0



**Table G-8C**  
**Rhode Island Energy**  
**2024 PIM and SQA (\$000)**

	Performance Incentive								
	Eligible Benefits		Eligible Costs	Eligible Net Benefits	Design Performance Achievement	Design Payout Rate	Design Performance Payout	Payout Cap	Service Quality Adjustment Applied
	100% Utility System Benefits	50% Resource Benefits							
Residential	\$10,056	\$371	\$15,209	-\$4,782	\$2,000	25.0%	\$500	\$625	TRUE
Income Eligible Residential	\$2,734	\$90	\$7,711	-\$4,888	\$2,000	25.0%	\$500	\$625	TRUE
Commercial & Industrial	\$15,838	\$272	\$8,511	\$7,599	\$7,599	11.7%	\$889	\$1,112	FALSE

	Service Quality Adjustment (SQA)				
	Eligible Benefits		Eligible Costs	Design Service Achievement	Maximum SQA
	100% Utility System Benefits	50% Resource Benefits			
Residential	\$10,056	\$371	\$15,209	\$10,428	\$304
Income Eligible Residential	\$2,734	\$90	\$7,711	\$2,824	\$109
Commercial & Industrial	\$15,838	\$272	\$8,511	\$16,111	\$0